



JUDICIARY OF
ENGLAND AND WALES

R

-v-

Carly Harris

In the Crown Court at Newport

17 December 2018

Sentencing Remarks of The Honourable Mr Justice Picken

1. Carly Harris, the jury's verdict is that you are Not Guilty of Murder by Reason of Insanity. I must now deal with you in the light of that verdict.
2. This case is a desperately sad one. It sees you standing where you are as a result of your having killed your 4-year old daughter, Amelia, on 8 June this year at the house in Brithweunydd Road in Trealaw, Tonypanydd which you shared with her and your two sons.
3. At about 9.15 pm that day, a neighbour of yours, Megan Griffiths, heard what sounded like a little girl screaming "*Mammy! Mammy! Mammy!*". The voice sounded panicked. A short while later, Megan Griffiths's boyfriend, Jake Barlow, heard your 17-year old son, Levi, screaming at you outside and asking you "*How could you. She's my only little sister!*". Angela Griffiths, Megan Griffiths's mother, went outside into the street where your other son, Jayden, aged just 10, ran up to her with arms outstretched. Hugging Mrs. Griffiths, he told her "*Amelia is dead, will my Mammy go to prison?*". Jayden was shaking

uncontrollably. Levi was also in the street, running around shouting *"You've killed her, You've killed her"* and retching as if to be sick.

4. You were seen by Mrs Griffiths to be standing at the top of a set of steps outside your house. Mrs Griffiths asked you what was going on. You replied saying words to the effect of *"God will be with her, the Angels have taken her"*. You appeared to be dazed.
5. Mrs Griffiths made a 999 call. She was asked by the operator to enter your property in order to see what had happened. As Mrs Griffiths began to do that, Levi told her *"She's out the fucking garden, she's burnt her"*. Mrs Griffiths and a friend, Lisa Evans, then went into the garden where they saw a coffee table with a square base. Amelia's dead body was lying on the table covered with a blanket. She looked black, her body was still smouldering and they could smell the burning body.
6. Shortly after that, on being arrested by the police on suspicion of murder, you stated *"Jesus told me to do it"*. Whilst sat in the back of the police van, you told the police that *"she will be okay, trust me, I'm not crazy, I promise you"* and made references to the *"Angels"* and *"Jesus"*, telling the police *"I promise you, Jesus is coming soon"*. Asked by one of the officers what had happened, you replied *"I promise you I wouldn't do that to my only girl if she wasn't returning"*.
7. You were then taken to Merthyr Tydfil Police Station. There, in the custody suite, you said *"I deserve to die"*, *"What the fuck my little girl"*, *"I must be possessed"*, *"They told me to"* and *"The Angels said it's got to be done"*.
8. The next day and the day after that, you were interviewed by the police. You described having visions of angels during the course of those interviews.
9. These facts speak for themselves. They need no elaboration. A young girl rich in promise met her death at the hands of her mother – and in the most horrific manner.
10. I have heard the medical evidence which has been given in court by Dr Arden Tomison, who has been instructed on your behalf and who is approved by the Secretary of State under s. 12(2) of the Mental Health Act 1983. I have also read the reports which have been prepared by Dr Tomison and by Dr Philip Joseph who has been instructed by the prosecution.
11. I am satisfied that you are suffering from a mental disorder, namely schizophrenia, and that this disorder is of a nature which makes it appropriate for you to be detained in a

hospital for medical treatment. I am satisfied also that appropriate medical treatment is available for you at the Cygnet Hospital in Stevenage, whilst noting that the intention is that as soon as possible you will be transferred, administratively, to a more local clinic.

12. I am required under s. 5(3) of the Criminal Procedure (Insanity) Act 1964 to make what is called a Hospital Order under s. 37 of the Mental Health Act 1983 with a Restriction Order under s. 41 of the 1983 Act. This is because a "*special verdict*" has been returned for the purposes of s. 5(1)(a) and that "*special verdict*" is in respect of "*an offence the sentence for which is fixed by law*" (namely Murder) for the purposes of s. 5(3)(a) – there being no issue that the Court has the power to make a Hospital Order (see s. 5(3)(b)).
13. In any event, I am of the opinion that, because of all the circumstances of your case, including the nature of the offence (namely Murder) of which you have been found Not Guilty by Reason of Insanity and your character which includes a history of mental illness, the most suitable method of dealing with your case is by making an order under s. 37 of the 1983 Act. I am also satisfied that it is necessary to protect the public from serious harm and that it is not possible to say for how long that will be so, and so that it is appropriate to order that you will be subject to the special restrictions set out in s. 41 of the 1983 Act without limit of time.

[Stand up, please]

14. I, therefore, make a Hospital Order under s. 37 of the 1983 Act ordering that you will be re-admitted to and detained at the Cygnet Hospital in Stevenage where you have been for the past several months.
15. I am satisfied that arrangements have been made for you to be re-admitted right way and, in any event, within 28 days to this hospital.
16. I also make a Restriction Order under s. 41 of the 1983 Act ordering that you will be subject to the special restrictions set out in s. 41 without limit of time.