

**AN INDEPENDENT INQUIRY INTO THE CARE AND
TREATMENT OF MARKOS MEZGEBE WITH REFERENCE
TO A FATAL INCIDENT ON 8 NOVEMBER 1998 RESULTING
IN THE DEATH OF MARKOS MEZGEBE'S SISTER**

REPORT

A. INTRODUCTION

1. Markos Mezgebe ("Markos"), a patient of the Central Wandsworth Community Mental Health Team ("CMHT") was arrested on 8 November 1998 and subsequently charged with the murder of his sister, Senait, who was at the time also his main carer. He was convicted by his plea on 10 May 1999 of manslaughter on the grounds of diminished responsibility and has been detained under Sections 37 and 41 of the Mental Health Act 1983.

- 2 We ("the Panel") have been commissioned by Merton Sutton and Wandsworth Health Authority to hold an independent inquiry into the fatal incident. Our terms of reference are as follows:-

A. *"To investigate the circumstances relating to the care and treatment of Markos Mezgebe by the local mental health and social services and in particular:-*

- (i) the quality scope and appropriateness of the assessment made of his health and social care needs and the assessment of risk of potential harm to himself or others;*
- (ii) the appropriateness of his specialist treatment and subsequent support, supervision and aftercare in the community including risk assessment and management;*
- (iii) the extent to which Markos Mezgebe's mental health care matched the statutory obligations, relevant Guidance from the Department of Health, including the Care Programme Approach. HC(90)23-LASSL(90)11, discharge guidance HSG(94)27 and local operational policies;*
- (iv) the history of the prescribed medication and his compliance with treatment regimes;*
- (v) the use of illegal substances included in the police reports and its possible implications in the case;*
- (vi) Markos Mezgebe's needs as a member of a minority ethnic group from his early contact as a minor onwards, whether these were adequately assessed and met, and whether in supporting the family adequate consideration was given to cultural issues;*

(vii) *the extent to which Markos Mezgebe's care plans were:-*

- *reflecting an assessment of risk;*
- *effectively drawn up;*
- *delivered and monitored;*
- *complied with by Markos Mezgebe;*

(viii) *any other factors to the delivery of care and treatment to Markos Mezgebe including the skills and competencies of staff involved in his care, the appropriateness of local policies and procedures, the appropriateness of training and development programmes and other relevant matters;*

B. To consider the adequacy and effectiveness of the collaboration and communication between all relevant agencies who were or should have been involved in Markos Mezgebe's assessments, treatment, care and safety, and the safety of others, and between the statutory agencies and Markos Mezgebe's family/informal carers.

C. To prepare a report to Merton Sutton and Wandsworth Health Authority and Wandsworth Borough Council and to make recommendations".

3. The members of the Panel are set out in **APPENDIX 1**.

4. In composing its report the Panel has had recourse to the following:-

- The original Children and Families case notes, from the Children and Families Division of Wandsworth Social Services Department - a summary of their involvement and the structure relating to the management of the key social worker with reference to Markos Mezgebe;

- A report for the Housing Department, Wandsworth Borough Council, dated 17 November 1992, prepared by Ms Ros Pines, Social Worker on an application for accommodation for Markos Mezgebe (a young person under the Children Act 1989, Section 20(3): see **APPENDIX II**).
- A preliminary report entitled "Report to the Board of Preliminary Investigation into Serious Untoward Incident - Markos Mezgebe" dated December 1998 prepared by Pathfinder Mental Health Services NHS Trust;
- The Report of the Markos Mezgebe Internal Serious Untoward Incident Inquiry dated 5 July 1999 from South West London and St George's Mental Health NHS Trust, Wandsworth Borough Council (Social Services Department), Merton Sutton and Wandsworth Health Authority;
- A Psychiatric Report dated 3 February 1999 prepared by Dr A G Kennedy, Consultant Forensic Psychiatrist prepared for the defence at the request of Solicitors representing Markos Mezgebe at his subsequent criminal trial;
- A Psychiatric Report dated 27 April 1999 prepared at the request of the Crown Prosecution Service for the purposes of the criminal trial;
- A Psychiatric Assessment, undated but prepared sometime after August 1999 by Dr Navinder Pal (SHO to Dr Vince, Consultant Forensic Psychiatrist), Forensic Mental Health Services at the request of South West London and St George's Mental Health NHS Trust;
- The Practice Notes of Dr Patel, Markos' General Practitioner;

- A preliminary report dated 10 November 1998 prepared by Dr J P Stephens, Duty Psychiatrist in Court Diversion Scheme and forwarded to Dr Maria Gabriella Zolese on 10 November 1998 whilst Markos Mezgebe was on remand before the South Western Magistrates' Court following his arrest for the index offence. The report was directed to the question whether Markos was in need of emergency transfer for psychiatric treatment in a hospital setting;
 - A report dated 21 May 1998 of an assessment made under Section 1 of the Carers (Recognition and Services) Act 1995 and Section 47 of the National Health Service and Community Care Act 1990 respectively by Jeremy Walker, Senior Social Worker of the Central Wandsworth Community Mental Health Team (CMHT). This report was sent to Messrs Fisher Meredith (Solicitors), the legal representatives of Senait Mezgebe (Markos' sister) who at the time was seeking permission to remain permanently in this country.
5. As background three members of the Panel visited the Adult Community Mental Health Team at Unit G, Garratt Court, Furmage Street, SW18 and also the In-Patient Ward at Springfield Hospital and spoke informally to the staff on duty.
6. The Panel interviewed the following persons:-
- Ms Ros Pines - Social Worker, Wandle Team, London Borough of Wandsworth;
 - Dr David Goldberg - Consultant Adolescent Psychiatrist Adolescent Community Team/Adolescent Service;

- Mr Colin Lambert - Community Psychiatric Nurse (CPN), Pathfinder Mental Health Services NHS Trust (CMHT);
 - Ms Premila Sham - Community Psychiatric Nurse (CPN), Pathfinder Mental Health Services NHS Trust (CMHT);
 - Dr Tamsin Kewley - Senior House Officer (SHO) in Psychiatry, Springfield Hospital, Glenburnie Road, London SW17 and Duty Doctor on 18 October 1998;
 - Dr Giovanni Polizzi - Senior House Officer (SHO) in Psychiatry, Springfield Hospital, Glenburnie Road, London SW17;
 - Dr Maria Gabriella Zolese - Consultant Psychiatrist, Pathfinder Mental Health Services NHS Trust, Springfield Hospital, and Markos Mezgebe's consultant;
 - Markos Mezgebe and his brother Yohannes at Springfield Hospital on 18 February 2000 (the interviewing members of the Panel were Dr Simon Baugh and Dr Brian Minty with a recording made by Mr Brian Morden, the Inquiry Co-ordinator).
7. The Panel also received written evidence from the following:-
- Ms Ros Pines - Social Worker, London Borough of Wandsworth];
 - Mr Simon Lancashire - Community Psychiatric Nurse (CPN), Pathfinder Mental Health Services NHS Trust (CMHT);
 - Mr Colin Lambert - Community Psychiatric Nurse (CPN), Pathfinder Mental Health Services NHS Trust (CMHT);

- Ms Premila Sham - Community Psychiatric Nurse (CPN), Pathfinder Mental Health Services NHS Trust (CMHT); -
- Siew Tuan Ng - Psychiatric Staff Nurse on Bluebell Ward, Springfield Hospital, Glenburnie Road, London SW17 and Markos Mezgebe's named nurse on his admission to Bluebell Ward, Springfield Hospital on 18 October 1998;
- Dr Tamsin Kewley - Senior House Officer (SHO) in Psychiatry, Springfield Hospital, Glenburnie Road, London SW17;
- Dr Giovanni Polizzi - Senior House Officer (SHO) in Psychiatry, Springfield Hospital, Glenburnie Road, London SW17;
- Dr Maria Gabriella Zolese - Consultant Psychiatrist, Pathfinder Mental Health Services NHS Trust;

8. Further material of which the Panel was appraised are:-

- A note of one session with Markos Mezgebe, Ms Ros Pines and Mr Chriso Andreou (a psychotherapist) on 9 August 1993 prepared by Mr Chriso Andreou: see **APPENDIX III**;
- A guide from the Pharmacy Department at Pathfinder Mental Health Services NHS Trust prepared by Mr Andy Fuller, Principal Pharmacist, Clinical Services, illuminating prescribing issues and highlighting the drugs which were prescribed to Markos Mezgebe: see **APPENDIX IV**;
- The notes of the Adolescent Community Team (ie. The Adolescent Service of the Pathfinder, Mental Health Services NHS Trust);

- The notes of the (Adult) Community Mental Health Team, in effect, The Pathfinder Mental Health Services NHS Trust;
- The notes of the In-Patient Services for Markos Mezgebe's stay in hospital;
- A chronology of contact with Wandsworth Social Services Children and Families Department in so far as it related to Markos Mezgebe from 8 September 1992 to 9 November 1998. [The Panel has adopted this chronology with amendments where appropriate]. There is also a chronology of contact with the Adolescent Service and the Adolescent Community Mental Health Team (CMHT) and of Markos' stay as an in-patient at Springfield Hospital [see **APPENDIX V**].;

B. MARKOS: THE BACKGROUND / PERSONAL / FAMILY DETAILS

9. Markos' parents, as indeed their children, originate from Tigre in Northern Ethiopia. Markos was born in Asmara, a small city in Eritrea. The area has been the setting for a civil war as the Eritreans battled for independence. The Mezgebés moved to Addis Ababa when Markos was 10 years of age. There he had to learn a new language, Amharic, which he found very difficult.
10. Markos is the youngest of six children. His siblings include two sisters (Senait now deceased by reason of the index offence) and three brothers. His eldest brother continues to live in Addis Ababa with both his parents. The second brother and his surviving sister live in Washington DC in the United States. His third brother, Yohannes, who will feature prominently in this report, arrived in England in 1990. Markos, then aged 15 years, joined his brother in England two years later in June 1992. It seems that it had been decided that the male siblings should travel abroad to continue their education. In addition, both Markos and Yohannes feared being conscripted into military service and having to fight their own people.
11. In England both Markos and his brother were regarded as political refugees; Yohannes has been granted political asylum and Markos was in the process of applying for a similar status.
12. After Yohannes arrived in England, he lived with various Ethiopian friends, in the main sleeping on floors. Eventually he came to reside at 72 Knowles House, Neville Gill Close, London SW18 and it was at this address that Markos joined his brother, both having been offered accommodation on a temporary basis. Neither was a tenant of 72 Knowles House. It seems that at first Yohannes felt obliged to undertake the care of Markos. However, he later became dissatisfied with this idea at least partly because he himself had a depressive illness.

13. In time Markos came to be registered at Ernest Bevin School. His English was poor, although he could communicate to a limited extent.

C. MARKOS AND SOCIAL SERVICES

The early contact

14. On 8 September 1992 Markos (then 15 years old) and his brother Yohannes (then 20 years old) attended Wandsworth Social Services and both were seen by a duty social worker. Yohannes told the duty social worker that he was unable to continue caring for Markos. He was quietly persistent in his contention that Markos would be better off with a family until he attained adulthood. Yohannes was himself at the time suffering from depression and was being treated on an outpatient basis. He had not however disclosed the disability nor the fact of his treatment to Markos. The opportunity was therefore taken at the interview (although there does not appear to have been any interpreter) for there to be a full and frank discussion between the brothers and the social worker. Yohannes impressed upon Markos his own feelings of depression and that Markos should seek help from others. This upset Markos. He did not want to be separated from his brother. However, Yohannes maintained that he was unable to continue caring for Markos.

The brothers were effectively homeless. Given their refugee status Social Services considered that housing, including bed and breakfast, would be of assistance to them. Contact was made with the Homeless Persons Unit (HPU) in order to try and secure some suitable accommodation. Markos was given money by Social Services to buy clothes more suited to the English climate. Steps were also taken to enrol Markos in a school.

Allocation of a Social Worker

15. Markos and Yohannes were later seen by Social Services and after a second interview the decision was taken to allocate Markos to a social worker. He was allocated to Ms Ros Pines, a member of the Wandle Team of Wandsworth Social Services on 22 September 1992. Markos remained on Ms Pines' case load until the file at Social Services was formally closed on 13 August 1995.
16. A summary of the role played by Social Services, and in particular, Ms Pines, is to be found at **APPENDIX V** beginning at 22 September 1992 through to 13 August 1995. The Panel however takes the view that in order to do justice to Social Services and in particular to the role played by Ms Pines, a more detailed reference to matters done during the relevant period should be included in the body of the report.

The Problems faced by Social Services: temporary resolution

17. It was manifest that the needs and desires of the brothers were in conflict. Yohannes felt he could not cope with his brother. Markos on the other hand wanted to be with Yohannes. There was the problem of their homelessness. The question of fostering was discussed between Ms Pines, Yohannes and Markos. Ms Pines was concerned about the emotional impact fostering would have on Markos, namely the severing of yet another link with his family. Wandsworth Social Services did not have any Ethiopian/Tigrean families registered as foster carers. Eventually it was agreed between Yohannes, Markos and Ms Pines and after discussion with the Wandle Team that Markos would be fostered. Yohannes could then see his psychiatrist or a counsellor. Yohannes would in time take Markos back when he himself was settled. It was agreed during discussions with the Team and with Yohannes and Markos that Ms Pines would liaise with the Housing Department to try and obtain suitable housing for Markos and Yohannes.

The parents of Markos would be notified (they were in fact notified in English) at the address given to Social Services of the decision to foster Markos. (It seems that the letter was not delivered as it was returned about a year after it was posted.)

18. Two families were approached and considered as potential foster carers. Markos thereafter made visits to these families. After a weekend visit it was decided with Markos' agreement that he would be fostered with Ms D G, a family of Caribbean origin. Markos moved in on 5 November 1992. The fostering was not successful. Markos found it difficult to adapt to the household rules. Further, Markos had begun to express feelings of unhappiness in particular that he was lonely. Ms Pines sought to alleviate the difficulties. She made visits to the foster-home a number of times. She also had discussions with Markos and his brother. For example, there was discussion between Ms Pines and Markos about the Ethiopian Civil War; his reasons for coming to England and his hope to be a civil engineer. In time Markos became more relaxed but problems continued during his fostering with Ms D G. The foster carer met with Markos and an interpreter to explore issues. That meeting appeared to have gone well but in further meetings between Markos and Ms Pines he continued to describe feelings of loss, conflict and unhappiness. Consideration was therefore given for a move to a second foster carer. The records show that Markos met new potential foster parents sometime in January 1993.

19. A second placement commenced on 9 February 1993. This fostering proved more successful. The new family, a Mr B N and Ms M W, appeared to be more understanding of Markos' cultural background. There was also another Eritrean male teenager who was fostered at the household with whom Markos could interact. Even so, Markos was not entirely happy being fostered. The foster carers reported that Markos was truanting.

This matter, and an alleged shoplifting incident were discussed by Social Services at a Review Meeting on 8 June 1993 though in respect of the shoplifting incident no charges had been brought. More alarmingly, Markos began to display signs of mental illness.

Action by Social Services: Markos' education

20. Markos was registered with and attended Ernest Bevin School. It was reported that he was doing fine. Ms Pines was however concerned about his apparently good report since in her view he could hardly understand English. She therefore contacted the school to make sure the report was correct and enquired of the school if extra tuition help could be given to Markos. The records show that arrangements were made for Markos to attend English and maths classes during the Summer holidays of 1993. Markos started attending college in September 1993. He appears to have made friends at college.

Action by Social Services: the securing of a tenancy

21. It will be recalled that it was decided that Social Services would try to assist in obtaining a council tenancy. This course was pursued whilst Markos was fostered. Ms Pines' approach shows that for her (and Social Services) the needs of Markos and his brother were paramount.
22. **APPENDIX II** sets out the report by Ms Pines to the Housing Department on the application for accommodation for Markos and Yohannes. The circumstances of the brothers are set out and Ms Pines opines that "*It would be in the best interests of both Markos and Yohannes for Markos to be accommodated with his brother in a Wandsworth tenancy. With social work support Yohannes will be a capable parent and be able to provide Markos with stability within his remaining family unit*".

23. When the decision was taken by the Housing Department that they were prepared to offer Yohannes and Markos a flat, Ms Pines did not foist the decision upon the brothers. Rather she wrote to the Housing Department informing them that she would like to discuss the offer with Yohannes *"to elicit his feelings about the Arndale Estate before expressing any preference on his behalf"*.
24. On obtaining the tenancy, Ms Pines encouraged Yohannes and Markos to carry out decorations to the flat. She also made arrangements with the foster carers in conjunction with the brothers for Markos to start staying at the flat with Yohannes at weekends before the end of his fostering. Thus, in a letter dated 1 June 1993 Ms Pines wrote:-

"Dear Markos,

On 7th June at 5.30 pm I have arranged a meeting with Yohannes, Bill, Marion and Broderick for us to talk about you beginning to stay at Yohannes' flat at weekends.

I have now seen the flat and I was very impressed by all the work you and Yohannes have put in to decorating it.

I look forward to seeing you on 7th".

25. On 1 December 1993 Ms Pines wrote:-

"Dear Yohannes and Markos,

As you both know the date that we set for Markos to move from Marian and Bill's is today, 1.12.93. We will stop funding Markos' placement from 1st December 1993. Marian will be giving Markos his savings. We all hope he will use these wisely.

We will also stop funding Markos at home as from 6.12.93 on the understanding that Yohannes will be receiving Income Support and Child Benefit.

So that we can talk about these arrangements I suggest that you both come and see me on Tuesday 7th December 1993 at 11.00 am. If you have any letters from the Department of Social Security please bring them with you then.

I look forward to seeing you".

Further supporting acts by Ms Pines

26. Ms Pines wrote to the Department of Social Security on 29 March 1993 in support of Yohannes' appeal for his application for a community care grant of £1,212.40. She pointed out that Yohannes had no supporting family in this country and that as a student he received £30.26 weekly upon which he supported himself. The letter continues:-

"However, Mr Mezgebe is in the unusual position of having a dependent sibling, his brother, Markos Mezgebe, aged 15. Mr Mezgebe is therefore in a parental role to his younger brother".

It is then emphasised that:-

" --- while caring for Markos, Mr Mezgebe suffered a debilitating depression which resulted in his receiving psychiatric help. It was undoubtedly due to the life stresses imposed by caring for his brother and trying to manage on a low income that Mr Mezgebe became depressed.

A Community Care Grant would also prevent further psychiatric illness on Mr Mezgebe's part. This in itself would prevent a further breakdown of the family if Mr Mezgebe could no longer care for Markos as a result of a further depressive illness".

The Arrival of Senait

27. It appears that, without informing Social Services, Yohannes had written to his parents in Ethiopia advising them of his feelings and Markos' mental health problems. In response the family sent Senait to whom Markos was most attached to care for him. Senait arrived it seems in early 1993. The records show that during a discussion on 5 January 1993 between Ms Pines and Markos he mentioned that "*a sister*" was due to visit England soon and that on 28 January 1993 he is reported as having spent a weekend "*with his sister*".
28. Yohannes, Markos and Senait shared the council flat. It was somewhat overcrowded, it having been designed to be shared by two people. There were tensions in the household. Nevertheless it seems that Markos and Senait were very close and when conflicts developed between the two brothers Senait was the peacemaker. In time continuing conflicts between Markos and Senait occurred mainly founded upon Markos' reluctance to take prescribed medication and his taking illicit drugs (cannabis).
29. The Panel would emphasise that Social Services were not appraised of the forthcoming arrival of Senait. Further, we find that it cannot be properly maintained that Senait's presence was necessary because of the failure of Social Services to deal adequately or properly with the welfare of Markos.

Action by Social Services: The onset of Markos' mental illness

30. We have already noted that during the second placement with Mr B N and Ms M W, Markos displayed signs of mental illness. The record puts the date as 14 April 1993. Psychotic symptoms began to emerge. His most persistent delusion at this time was that he was being filmed by a camera through the window of his bedroom. Further, he claimed to be hearing particularly disturbing voices and could not sleep properly at night. Markos believed that his foster carers were following him and that they, as he saw it, believed he was making sexual advances to their daughter. There was the further belief that the foster family were categorising him as "gay" and that they were laughing at him. Markos expressed the belief that he "*will be dead in a couple of months*".

31. Ms Pines took the initiative on 22 April 1993 and contacted the Adolescent Community Team Pathfinder Mental Health Services NHS Trust and discussed the mental signs that Markos was displaying. A consultation was offered should it become clear that Markos' symptoms were persisting.

32. An appointment was made with Mr Chriso Andreou, psychotherapist to Pathfinder, and on 9 August 1993 Markos, Ms Pines and Mr Andreou met. Markos, though not fluent in English, described "vividly" how he felt. He described feeling isolated and being watched by a camera. He expressed the view that his problems stemmed from the fact that he lived with foster carers. He maintained that he wanted to return to Ethiopia after finishing his studies. It was agreed that Markos would commence a remedial programme beginning in September 1993. See **APPENDIX III**. Markos however failed to keep the appointment made for September 1993.

33. The signs of Markos' mental problems persisted in varying degrees after September 1993. In discussions with Ms Pines Markos said "*he was still hearing voices*" and that he had difficulty in challenging the voices. He visited his General Practitioner, Dr Patel and was prescribed drugs "*to calm him down*". Ms Pines discussed Markos' problems with his brother who stated that mental illness did not run in the family and that Markos' experiences were probably related to stress and a change of culture.
34. Markos was discharged from the care of Social Services on 6 December 1993. Nevertheless Ms Pines continued to show an interest in Markos even after she was told to close the file in May 1994. Indeed, Ms Pines did not formally close the file until 13 August 1995. Paragraphs 35-40 herein shows Ms Pines' attitude to Markos.
35. On 25 March 1994 Ms Pines wrote to Dr Aggrey Burke, a consultant psychiatrist (with particular interest in ethnic cases), attached to the Department of Adult Psychiatry, St George's Hospital Pathfinder Community and Specialist and Mental Health Services by letter as follows:-

"Dr Burke,

I recently spoke to you about my client, Markos Mezgebe. Markos is a young Eritrean refugee who came to this country nearly 2 years ago. Markos lives with his brother and sister in a council flat.

When Markos first arrived in this country he went to live with his brother Yohannes. At the time, Yohannes was in unsatisfactory housing. He was sharing a flat with some Ethiopian friends and sleeping on the floor. Yohannes had not presented himself to Social Services previously. He was, however, quite depressed and had been since his arrival in England, some 2/3 years previously.

He was unable to cope with Markos and asked for Markos to be accommodated. After a period of negotiation we agreed to accommodate Markos short-term until the Housing Department could provide a flat for the brothers.

At the time (5.11.92) Markos was 16 and presented as a shy, quiet, young man. He spoke very little English. He was upset by his brother's mental state and frightened by the situation in which he found himself.

Markos moved into one foster placement which soon broke down. In his second placement, February 1993, Markos began to hear voices. Initially Markos was convinced that these voices were the family's attempts to persecute him. When he subsequently returned to live with his brother he was upset and confused that the voices followed him. I referred Markos to the Adolescent Unit where he saw Chriso Andreou. He only attended for one session.

Today, Markos is much more able to talk about the voices. He says they tell him he is "gay" which he finds very upsetting. He says that he particularly hears these voices at quiet times when trying to concentrate on his studies. (He attends South Thames College). He believes that these voices are real people who want to persecute him.

He fears they will stop him from returning to Eritrea. I have tried to talk to Markos about the voices being an auditory hallucination. Markos also has visual hallucinations in that he sees messages that he is "gay" written on the lifts and on buses in code.

Markos is not exhibiting any behaviour that leads me to believe he is a risk either to himself or to others. However, naturally he is depressed by the voices which at times talk to him day and night.

I have spoken to Markos about seeing you or going to another counselling service. His brother and sister have also spoken to him. However, Markos refuses to see anyone. He does not believe that anyone can help.

Could you advise me on how to proceed with this case or what services you may be able to offer. Markos knows I will be speaking to you".

36. Dr Burke replied by letter dated 15 April 1994. He described Markos' case "as a most interesting case" and concluded:-

"We would be only too happy to take this patient on to our list and I would suggest that in the first instance he might benefit by having the opportunity of having a joint visit from one or two members of the team.

I am copying the material to members of the team and would be grateful if you would come back to inform us that the patient's family would be willing to be seen at home.

We look forward to hearing from you".

37. Ms Pines discussed Dr Burke's response with Yohannes and Senait in the hope that they could persuade Markos to take up the services of Dr Burke and his team. By letter dated 29 April 1994 she wrote to Dr Burke as follows:-

"Dear Dr Burke

Thank you for your kind response to my letter of 25 March 1994 re: Markos Mezgebe (dob. 2.4.77).

I have been able to meet with Markos' brother, Yohannes, today. Yohannes and his sister would be very happy to meet with you or your team at their home. Yohannes feels that Markos' condition is deteriorating in that Markos now spends a lot of time in bed and he is failing at college. Unfortunately, Markos' illness has caused some strife in his relationship with his brother. Yohannes has tried to urge Markos to accept help and this has caused Markos to see Yohannes as siding with the voices.

Although it is possible that Markos will refuse to see you on your visit, I feel it would certainly be very helpful for this family if they could receive advice from your team.

If you would like fuller information, please do not hesitate to contact me on the above telephone number".

38. It appears that after some persuasion, Markos did agree to see members of Dr Burke's team on 18 May 1994. No contact, however, was made. Ms Pines told the Internal Enquiry that Dr Burke's team attempted to meet Markos and his siblings on three occasions and that it was possible one meeting failed to occur because she had given Dr Burke the wrong flat number for the Mezgebés.
39. Ms Pines continued to engage Yohannes, Senait and Markos and encouraged him between May 1994 and August 1995 to seek help from the professional services but with little success. Further, as will be seen from Dr Goldberg's letter dated 31 January 1995, Ms Pines attended a meeting that day called by him together with the Mezgebe family. Ms Pines sometimes saw Markos in the street.

40. On 21 March 1995 Ms Pines wrote to Dr Zolese, consultant psychiatrist in the Central Wandsworth Community Mental Health Team ("CMHT") as follows:-

"Dear Dr Zolese

I am writing in reference to the above young man. I began working with Markos in September 1992 when his brother Yohannes requested that Markos be accommodated by Wandsworth Social Services. At that time Yohannes appeared to be suffering from a severe depression. He felt totally inadequate and unable to care for his younger brother.

Markos was accommodated in 2 foster placements. His first placement with Mrs G from November 1992 until February 1993 was not a particularly happy one. However, it was in his second, more settled placement with BN and MW from February to December 1993 that his psychotic symptoms began to emerge. Markos' most persistent delusion was that he was being filmed by a camera through the window of his bedroom.

At that time I referred Markos to the Adolescent Community Team. Markos was not able to take up the service. When Markos returned home in December 1993 I tried to work with Markos and his brother to enable them to seek psychiatric help for Markos. Eventually Yohannes wrote to his family in Eritrea and asked for his sister to be sent to help him to care for Markos. In April 1994 I referred Markos to Dr Aggrey Burke. Once more the family were not able to engage with the service.

Although I remained superficially involved with the Mezgebe family since April 1994, I have been unable to engage Markos to work on these issues. Dr Goldberg's recent intervention, I feel has been very helpful in that he has enabled Yohannes (Panel emphasis) to really understand the serious nature of his brother's illness.

As it appears that Markos' illness is responsive to medication but that the family need persistent intervention, I was wondering if it might be possible for a social worker to be allocated from your team to work alongside the family. I am writing on the advice of Dr Goldberg who feels that social work support from the CMHT will be very helpful in this case. As Markos is now over 18 years of age it is also appropriate that I transfer this case into a different sector.

I hope that you will be able to accept this letter of referral. If you would like further information, please do not hesitate to contact me on the above telephone number".

41. We refer to the fact that Ms Pines "*remained superficially involved with the Mezgebe family since April 1994*" (cf. Ms Pines' letter to Dr Zolese dated 21 March 1995, para. 40). It seems that Ms Pines had been told to close the file on Markos in May 1994. She conceded that thereafter she was "*more reactive than proactive*". When asked why she adopted that stance she indicated that although Markos was subject to Section 24 of the Children Act 1989, after care was neither requested nor necessary: Markos was at home; he had been rehoused and his sister was present providing responsible care.

There was also the referral to Dr Burke which she hoped would have provided the necessary expertise particularly as Dr Burke's team was content to make home visits. So far as the psychiatric services were concerned both Ms Pines and her team leader felt "*they had gone as far as we could go --- there was not a further road to travel down*". Nevertheless, Ms Pines was not content with Markos' situation. Thus she could not "*physically close the file; it sort of went into the pending arena*".

42. It will be recalled that Ms Pines did not formally close the file at Social Services until 13 August 1995.

D. MARKOS: REFERRAL TO THE ADOLESCENT COMMUNITY TEAM

43. Reference has already been made to Ms Pines' referral of Markos (at which both were present) to Mr Chriso Andreou, a psychotherapist on 9 August 1993 and the general discussion during that session; and that there was no further engagement in response to Mr Andreou's offer for the appointment in September 1993 (see para. 32).
44. Dr Zolese of the Central Wandsworth Community Mental Health Team (CMHT) in her written statement states that "*Markos was first referred to the psychiatric team (Panel emphasis) at Pathfinder Mental Health Services NHS Trust on 5 January 1995 when he was aged 17. It was decided to refer him to the Community Adolescent Team under the care of Dr David Goldberg, consultant psychiatrist, as his responsible officer ("RMO"). Some of his care was provided by one of my community psychiatric nurses, Colin Lambert*".

45. Mr Lambert (CPN) gave evidence to the Panel. He was extremely vague and claimed to have very little recollection of the facts relating to Markos. However, Mr Lambert's practical assistance to Markos and his family is noted below.
46. In a written report dated 19 October 1995 Mr Lambert makes reference to "*Markos (being) referred to the Adolescent Community Team under the consultant psychiatrist, Dr Goldberg, by his social worker, Ros Pines*" and that "*he had difficulty taking up the service*". It appears to the Panel that Mr Lambert is here referring to Ms Pines and Markos' session with Mr Andreou, psychotherapist, on 9 August 1993. Dr Goldberg was appointed locum in October 1994 and consultant in April 1995 thus a referral to him could not have been made in August 1993.
47. The position thus appears to be that the first referral to the Wandsworth Community Mental Health Team (CMHT) was by Dr Patel, GP, on 30 December 1994. (As will be seen later, Dr Patel was kept regularly informed of Markos' fluctuating progress by Dr Goldberg, Child and Adolescent Psychiatrist). Dr Patel did not give oral evidence to the Panel, nor to the Internal Inquiry. His case notes were seen by the Panel.
48. The records show that Dr Parikh and Mr Colin Lambert from the CMHT undertook a home visit on 5 January, when Dr Parikh took a history from Markos.
49. On the following day Markos' case was discussed by the CMHT meeting, and it was decided to refer the case to Dr Goldberg.
50. On 10 January Dr Goldberg wrote to Markos offering him his first appointment, mentioning the fact that "*Dr Parikh, the doctor you saw earlier this month, has asked me to meet you as he is concerned about you*".

Dr Goldberg / The Adolescent Community Team / Adolescent Service:

Their involvement

51. On 17 January 1995 "*the onward referral*" having been forwarded to Dr David Goldberg, consultant psychiatrist, Markos was seen together with Yohannes. Dr Goldberg records Markos as shy and suspicious of people. On assessment Markos is described as psychotic and paranoid which could be related to Markos' past experiences. Dr Goldberg prescribed 50 mg of chlorpromazine to be taken nightly. A follow-up appointment was made for 31 January 1995 at which Markos, Yohannes and Ros Pines were expected to attend.
- 52 Dr Goldberg's association with Markos and his siblings continued until he became 20 years old when the case was transferred to the Adult Mental Health Team. We set out hereunder in date order a narrative of Dr Goldberg's involvement with Markos and his siblings as well as others where relevant after the meeting on 17 January 1995:-

- (i) 18 January 1995 (to Dr Patel):-

"Dear Dr Patel

re: Markos Mezgebe (02.04.77) 45 Wentworth Court, Garratt Lane,
SW18

Thank you for referring Markos indirectly. He currently is paranoid with auditory hallucination, multiple delusions which are hard to interpret and possible thought diffusion.

It is impossible to say at the moment whether this paranoid state is related to Markos' past experience of whether he is developing a major psychiatric illness. I have commenced him on chlorpromazine 50 mg, nocte and will be monitoring this closely.

I have alerted his brother Yohans and have called a family meeting to include a trusted member of the church and Markos' social worker, Ros Pines. I will be keeping you in touch with developments".

(ii) 18 January 1995 (to Yohannes and Markos):-

"Dear Yohannes and Markos

Thank you for coming to see me yesterday. I am very worried about what is happening to you at the moment, Markos. I suggest that you tell all the members of your family, including your parents and brother in Addis Ababa and your brother and sister in Washington.

I think it is important to get their advice. I think the next step is for me to meet with both of you again, your sister, someone you trust from the church and Ros Pines, social worker. I have spoken to Ros and she is able to meet with us at 9.30 am on Tuesday 31 January.

I also think that the chlorpromazine medication at 50 mg at night may help you, Markos.

I look forward to meeting you next Tuesday to find out how the medication is helping and whether it should be decreased or increased. If you have any issues to discuss in the meantime, please telephone.

With best wishes".

(iii) 31 January 1995 (to Markos):-

"Dear Markos

Today I met your brother and sister together with Ros Pines, social worker. They are very worried about you, about the voices you hear, about your feelings of being followed, that you sleep poorly and that you have had to give up college and are unable to go out to pursue your career. Both your brother and sister want to help you as much as possible but are unsure what to do next.

I told them that they were right to be worried as the voices and paranoia seem to be taking over your life. I believe you will be able to take control of your life when you take regular medication, go out every day to college or day centre and discuss everyday difficulties with your family and mental health professionals.

Yohannes told us that you have not taken the medication and feel unable to visit me here at the Adolescent Community Team. I am worried that the voices and paranoia may get worse and you feel forced to place yourself in danger in response to the voices.

If this crisis comes and your brother and sister are unable to cope I suggest they contact your GP, Dr Patel, or the emergency psychiatric team who may have to admit you as an emergency to Springfield Hospital. I hope this does not happen and that you get the help you need.

One option could (be) for you to move into a mental health hostel where you will be able to get help you need. Ros Pines will be finding out about such hostels in Wandsworth and hopefully asking you and your family to visit them to see if they are suitable.

I have arranged with your brother and sister, together with Ros Pines, to meet here at 10.00 am on Tuesday 14 February to plan out the next step. I hope you will be able to come. Please telephone if you have any questions. Do ask your cousin or anybody else you may feel may help to this meeting.

I look forward to seeing you again then".

It is plain from the above letter that Markos did not attend the appointment fixed for 31 January 1995.

(iv) 15 February 1995 (to Dr Patel):-

"Dear Dr Patel

Re: Markos Mezgebe (02.04.77) 45 Wentworth Court, Garratt Lane, SW18

Markos has responded to a small dose of anti-psychotics, chlorpromazine, 50 mg nocte but is becoming less paranoid. He is now able to sleep in his own bed, leave the flat alone and go to college. He describes in the past tense a feeling of being followed, menacing voices from upstairs, the ability to read people's minds and a sense of paranoid anxiety.

I am slowly increasing his anti-psychotic medication, working with his brother and sister and looking for a suitable day resource he may be able to use.

For further information, please contact me".

(v) 21 February 1995 (to Markos):-

"Dear Markos

I am glad that you are feeling better and are able to return to college, join a youth club and play football. I am pleased that the medication Chlorpromazine 50 mg at night is helping but know that the noise from upstairs is worrying you a great deal.

I suggest that you go on medication during the day such as Stematil 5 mg twice daily which may help you feel less.persecuted.

If and when you feel the time is right to try out this medication to see if it helps, please contact me. I look forward to seeing you again with Yohannes and Senait at 1.00 pm on Tuesday 7 March. Please telephone if you want to talk to me before then".

(vi) 8 March 1995 (to Dr Patel):-

"Dear Dr Patel

Re: Markos Mezgebe (02.04.77) 45 Wentworth Court, Garratt Lane, SW18

Markos has responded to anti-psychotic medication, currently Stelazine 5 mg b.d. He is feeling more relaxed, less worried and paranoid. He is able to ignore the voices and go to college. He finds college difficult partly because he has missed so much work, has difficulty with English and, probably, suffers occasional paranoid anxiety when he feels in a difficult situation.

I will continue seeing Markos with his brother regularly and will keep you informed of progress.

With best wishes".

(vii) 21 March 1995 (to Dr Parikh):-

"Dear Dr Parikh

re: Markos Mezgebe (02.04.77) 45 Wentworth Court, Garratt Lane, SW18

In January this year you kindly referred Markos to this team. Your initial impression that Markos had a paranoid state proved correct and he has partially responded to oral and anti-psychotic medication. Engagement and introduction to medication has been a prolonged process. Many issues remain to be dealt with and attendance is irregular.

Markos requires careful follow-up including home visiting. As this team does not as yet have a CPN I would be pleased if Mr Michael, with whom I have discussed this issue, could join me in following up this young man".

(viii) 28 March 1995 (to Dr Patel):-

"Dear Dr Patel

re: Markos Mezgebe (02.04.77) 45 Wentworth Court, Garratt Lane, SW18

Markos did not attend his last appointment, nor has he contacted us in the last two weeks. As I am concerned I am alerting you and would be pleased to see Markos or his brother or sister at short notice.

I am consulting Dr Zolese's team to either seek assistance of their CPN and possibly social worker or, at an appropriate time, to transfer the case back to Dr Parikh who initially referred".

(ix) 5 April 1995 (to Dr Patel):-

"Dear Dr Patel

re: Markos Mezgebe (02.04.77) 45 Wentworth Court, Garratt Lane, SW18

Markos has failed to contact the Adolescent Community Team. His paranoid anxiety has decreased on Stelazine and he was going out more. As this medication I have prescribed will have run out by now he may again be liable to become paranoid.

If he does attend your surgery, please telephone me so we can coordinate your response".

(x) 28 April 1995 (to Dr Patel):-

"Dear Dr Patel

re: Markos Mezgebe (02.04.77) 45 Wentworth Court, Garratt Lane, SW18

I have not seen Markos for some weeks. I have linked up with Mr Colin Lambert CPN of Central Wandsworth Community Mental Health Team who will work to engage Markos and his family".

(xi) 17 May 1995 (to Markos, Yohannes and Senait):-

"Dear Markos, Yohannes and Senait

I was pleased to see you, Markos, yesterday and pleased that you plan to find a way to live with the voices and return to college in September. The meeting with Colin Lambert CPN was very helpful.

I write to invite you all to meet Colin Lambert and me at 3.00 pm on Friday 2 June at Central Wandsworth Community Mental Health Team where he works. This is based at Unit G, Garratt Court, Furmage Street, SW18 (of Garratt Lane near the Brocklebank Health Centre, 249 Garratt Lane).

At this meeting we can discuss and plan how Markos can take control of and live with the voices. In the meantime, I have prescribed Markos the tablets that helped him before but at a lower dose, Stelazine, 5 mg twice a day. Markos and Colin will be meeting regularly in the meantime.

Please telephone me here or Colin (0181 877 9311) if you have any questions.

*Dr David Goldberg
Consultant Psychiatrist*

cc. Dr Julie Hollyman".

(xii) 17 May 1995 (to Dr Patel):-

"Dear Dr Patel

re: Markos Mezgebe (02.04.77) 45 Wentworth Court, Garratt Lane, SW18

Markos has re-engaged with me following the active intervention of Colin Lambert CPN at Central Wandsworth Community Mental Health Team.

Markos continues to be troubled by disparaging voices. I have recommenced Stelazine 5 mg bd, the level that helped him previously. I hope to engage Markos, his brother and his sister, to help Markos return to college".

(xiii) 6 June 1995 (to Markos):-

"Dear Markos

I am glad that you are feeling so much better and able to enjoy life even with the voices. I agree with you that the medication has helped but you also feel that you are learning more to be not interrupted from what you want to do by the voices. I look forward to hearing how the increase of Stelazine from 5 mg twice a day to 15 mg nightly helps you with the voices. You may need to take the procyclidine 5 mg tablet if and when your tongue gets stuck. Be careful not to take more than three of these in one day.

I know you are thinking about going to college in September but are hesitant in case the voices get worse. The dilemma is between staying where you are or moving forward in your career which has risks. I think the best way, as Colin said, is take it in steps first by looking what courses are available. The six month course in electronics sounds fine. I would be pleased to learn more about it. From experience I know that it is easier to get to college when you have planned it with your family. Please do ask your brother and sister to come to the next appointment at 11.15 on 23 June at ACT. Writing to your parents and telling them your plans is likely to be a good idea. Colin Lambert and I will see our main job is to help you live with or combat the voices. I will be interested to hear what you think of the BBC film about living with voices. Maybe we can choose one of the strategies suggested to help. Lots of people find using a tape recorder helpful. You could consider this when Colin visits you at home".

(xiv) 26 June 1995 (to Markos):-

"Dear Markos

I am glad things are going so much better. I guess this must be due to both your work with Colin and the medication (Stelazine 15 mg nocte). I was sorry not to see you last week with your brother and sister to think of ways you will get on a suitable college course.

Unfortunately I will be away for 6-8 weeks but I know you will be meeting Colin to continue the work on controlling the voices and increasing your concentration.

When I return to work I will contact you with another appointment time. If in the meantime you and Colin become concerned, please telephone Kathy Donaldson, the social worker you have already met here. She may offer you an appointment or arrange for you to see Dr Turk who will be covering my work while I am away.

cc. *Colin Lambert CPN*

(xv) 10 October 1995 (to Dr Patel):-

"Dear Dr Patel

re: Markos Mezgebe (02.04.77) 45 Wentworth Court, Garratt Lane, SW18

Markos is well working hard at college and enjoying the social life. He has no "voices" on Stelazine 5 mg bd. He aims to succeed in engineering and improve his verbal fluency and vocabulary.

Colin Lambert CPN will be following Markos' progress and I will arrange to review the situation in 3 months' time".

On 20 October 1995 and 20 November 1995 respectively Dr Goldberg responded to Solicitors for Senait in support of her application to the Home Office for permanent residence in this country. Dr Goldberg made it plain that it is his belief *"that Senait as the older sister has provided a secure base from which Markos has made a recovery"* and that *"he will require continuing support from his brother and sister for the foreseeable future"*.

(xvi) 21 February 1996 (to Dr Patel):-

"Dear Dr Patel

re: Markos Mezgebe (02.04.77) 45 Wentworth Court, Garratt Lane, SW18

I met with Markos yesterday with Colin Lambert CPN at Central Wandsworth Community Mental Health Team.

Markos is recovering from a two week or more episode of increased persecutory, auditory hallucinations called "voices" or "noises". He has found that discontinuation of cannabis smoking and a return to Stelazine 15 mg daily has helped.

The situation is changing for Markos. He is growing and presents in a more confident manner. He is now able to recognise the differences between naturally occurring sounds and his "voices" and no longer believes that he is persecuted by unknown others.

He acknowledges that he has developed into a shy person and wishes to learn to be more at ease socialising. He welcomed joining a "socialisation" group of young people at the Adolescent Day Therapy Service which will soon be starting up. He was unable to continue at college because of difficulties concentrating and sensitivity to the perceived view of others. However, his confidence has improved, he is planning to enter a Motor Vehicle Qualification Course later in the year. I hope that he will have proved to himself that he will be able to continue this course by increasing his structured social activities such as entering a short educational course.

Dr Goldberg gave effect to his suggestion in respect of Markos joining a short social skills course by contacting a social worker Shahnaz Khan who was attached to the Adolescent Service. She in turn invited Markos to join the course which was scheduled to start on 12 February 1996. Markos failed to take up the offer and on 15 April 1996 he was written to by Cassie Lock, Occupational Therapist, of the Adolescent Service inviting him to attend the next meeting on Friday 19 April. Markos did take up that invitation and indeed attended the course.

On the same day, ie. 19 April 1996, following Markos' attendance he was written to by Shahnaz Khan and Cassie Lock in the following terms:-

"Dear Markos

Thank you for coming today. It was a pleasure to meet you.

At the end of each meeting Shahnaz and I write a summary of what was discussed and send it to the group members so that we do not forget what was said or thought about.

It was great to hear that you feel better more and more. So much better that you were surprised at how well you feel after having been so ill three years ago.

We also thought that for a young man arriving in this country with no English that you spoke very well in describing your life and experiences of your home and of England. We actively talked about politics, religion and philosophy! We told you that the other young man, C, whom we helped last week wanted the group to help him with getting fit, making friends and learning to cook. You seem to think these would be helpful to you as well.

You also added that you would like to use the group to practice your English, to improve your concentration, and practice being in crowded places. You also said you liked to be less quiet in a crowd (you were very busy and noisy back in Ethiopia!).

We think that the group would help you practice these things and we look forward to working with you.

Hopefully next week at least one other young man will be with us but if not we can still continue what we started today.

If we have remembered things badly or not remembered them at all, please tell us this week.

Cheers.

Cassie Lock

Occupational Therapist

Shahnaz Khan

Social Worker".

The records we have seen do not disclose whether there was a further meeting with Markos present. We however understand that the records of the social skills groups are kept separately.

Dr Goldberg's involvement continues as follows:-

(xvii) 24 May 1996 (to Dr Patel):-

"Dear Dr Patel

re: Markos Mezgebe (02.04.77) 45 Wentworth Court, Garratt Lane, SW18

I was pleased to see Markos yesterday. He presented in a confident articulate manner, able to discuss adversities ahead. He wants to continue Stelazine medication as at present he is able to ignore the occasional intrusive auditory hallucination and concentration and has no side effects.

He has finished his Jobseekers course, is currently distributing leaflets and plans to become a car attendant at Sainsburys before doing a course such as the car mechanics course at South Thames college to which he has applied.

We discussed numerous strategies for him to perfect his English. Markos is particularly attracted to the idea of doing Amharic or Tigrean conversation sessions to students from SOAS in exchange for time spent in conversational English.

I am due to see him next at 9.30 am on Tuesday 6 August but would be pleased to meet him sooner if any problems arise.

cc. *Colin Lambert CPN".*

(xviii) 6 June 1996 (to Markos, Yohannes and Senait):-

"Dear Markos, Yohannes and Senait

Thank you for phoning Yohannes. I was worried to hear that you, Markos, have not been sleeping and have had the return of disturbing thoughts. When we met a few weeks ago I was pleased that you were doing so well and getting on.

Do you think this upset may be connected with stopping the medication?

Please come to see me either at 10.00 am on Friday June 7 or Monday 10 June at 11.00 am.

If you have any questions, please phone.

(xix) 10 June 1996 (to Dr Patel):-

"Dear Dr Patel

re: Markos Mezgebe (02.04.77) 45 Wentworth Court, Garratt Lane, SW18

Markos having made excellent progress has had a recurrence of paranoid ideation and muffled auditory hallucinations, sleeplessness associated with derealisation anxiety. This is in the context of stopping his medication for one week, one month's cannabis smoking, the prolonging of his sister's appeal against deportation, Colin Lambert, his CPN, moved to another job and me telling him on his previous visit how well he was doing.

This is the second occasion cannabis smoking has been associated with relapse.

Markos has promised himself not to use cannabis again and take his medication regularly. He wants to take Stelazine 5 mg daily but I have asked him to take 10 mg daily. If his mental state stabilises, on this level, I suggest he uses 10 mgs spansules daily. I have given him chlorpromazine 25 mg to use as a sedative at night and will see him and his sister in four days' time. I will keep you informed of any changes. Please phone if you need further information".

There is a letter addressed to Dr Goldberg from Colin Lambert CPN dated 30 May 1996 which arrived at the Adolescent Service on 18 June. It expresses concerns by Senait of Markos' problems, mainly due to him smoking cannabis and not sleeping well. There is a letter from Dr Goldberg addressed to Markos as follows:-

(xx) 24 June 1996 (to Markos):-

"Dear Markos

This is the letter we said we would write.

We are glad that things have improved. We agree with you that taking the medication and stop smoking cannabis has made a difference. The next steps are to move to your own bed. You said that now was the time to do this.

When you think the time is right it will become the time to counter the voices or feelings of suspicion. We make two suggestions:

1. *On alternative days you can either argue with the voices while on the other days do not argue with them. In that way you can find out whether silence or arguing back works better.*
2. *Place a pebble in your pocket or cardboard note with a message written in your pocket. When you get an unpleasant thought about the past which may prompt you to wonder whether others are talking about you, you grab hold of the pebble and remember the message.*

With best wishes

cc. Julie Anderson, Nurse Specialist in Adolescents".

(xxi) Ms Julie Anderson, Nurse Specialist in Adolescents wrote to Markos on 17 July 1996 as follows:-

"Dear Markos

Dr Goldberg and I have tried to contact you by telephone to see how things are going for you. Each time we have phoned you have been out at work.

So that we do not lose contact with you Markos, I would like to come and visit you at YOUR HOME ON THURSDAY 1 AUGUST AT 10.00 AM. If this time is not convenient for you, please telephone Dr Goldberg or me to arrange another appointment and also to let me know how are you.

Julie Anderson

Nurse Specialist in Adolescence"

On 1 August 1996 Ms Anderson visited Markos and his sister at their home. Markos was working and he indicated that he wanted to stay in his job rather than return to college. His concentration is said to be still poor but he is sleeping well. He is said to be hearing voices but feels he can cope with them. He is continuing with his medication and has discontinued his use of cannabis.

On 2 October 1996 Dr Goldberg wrote to Markos and informed him that he had spoken to Senait who confirmed that Markos was doing well. Markos was invited to stay in touch.

Dr Goldberg wrote to Dr Patel on 27 January 1997 as follows:-

(xxii) 27 January 1997 (to Dr Patel):-

"Dear Dr Patel

re: Markos Mezgebe (02.04.77) 45 Wentworth Court, Garratt Lane, SW18

Markos applied to see me after he had dropped from follow-up for the last 8 months.

Markos had been doing well maintaining his employment as a removal man, stopping smoking cannabis and enjoying his social and church activities. Although he occasionally hears intrusive voices which make him feel suspicious, he is able to continue social interactions without becoming paranoid. He tells me he regularly takes the Stelazine 5 mg daily which you prescribed.

Markos sought follow-up as he has recently had difficult initiating sleep. This has been associated with loss of his job as part of a new one in catering. He stopped liking his previous job as a new employee who shouted did not give Markos enough time for Markos to understand him. Markos chose to oversleep repeatedly and as a result got the sack. Although Markos has improved over the last year showing a much wider range of expression and helped by his better English he continues to minimalise his worries - possibly deportation of his sister to Ethiopia predicted difficulty when he returns to South Thames College in September and any inter personal difficulties in his job.

Markos committed himself to regular follow-up here, continuation of the Stelazine at 5 mg daily joining his brother in daily exercise and discussing his day to day worries with his family and me.

Please telephone me if and when we need to co-ordinate our involvement".

(xxiii) 7 March 1997 (to Dr Patel):-

"Dear Dr Patel

re: Markos Mezgebe (02.04.77) 45 Wentworth Court, Garratt Lane, SW18

Markos has had a recurrence of paranoid symptoms with increasing suspiciousness and more auditory hallucinations of unpleasant noises.

He now feels that these are part of his illness and not due to unknown others getting at him. This recent exacerbation appears to have been linked to interpersonal difficulties at his portering job from which he has since resigned.

I have increased his Stelazine to 10 mg daily and will be seeing him again next week. As Markos is approaching his 20th birthday I am contacting his local Adult Community Mental Health team to discuss transfer.

Dr Goldberg wrote to Dr Zolese on 7 March 1997 and requested that her team (the Adult Team) take over Markos' psychiatric care as he was soon to be 20 years old and the Adolescent Service was therefore no longer appropriate. The letter was in the following terms:-

(xxiv) 7 March 1997 (to Dr Zolese, Central Wandsworth CMHT):-

"Dear Dr Zolese

re: Markos Mezgebe (02.04.77) 45 Wentworth Court, Garratt Lane, SW18

As Markos will be 20 years old in June 1997 I am requesting that your team takes over Markos' psychiatric care. Members of your team may remember Markos as Colin Lambert CPN worked with me in Outreach work in the past"

A potted version of the history of Markos is then set out and Dr Goldberg concludes as follows:-

"I will be pleased to arrange a handover meeting and suggest that this may best be held at the GP's surgery as this is where Markos presents when distressed".

Until the formal handover to the Adult Team, Dr Goldberg continued to be involved in Markos' care. Thus, on 13 March 1997 Markos is seen by Dr Goldberg. He looks well but is hallucinating. Some of these involve commands, for example "*sit up*", "*wake up*". Dr Goldberg is of the view that there has been no change in Markos' situation since his previous appointment and therefore decides to persist with the current medication. An appointment is made with Markos for him to be seen in one week's time.

On 19 March Markos is again seen by Dr Goldberg. Markos maintained that he did not feel like getting up in the mornings. He continued to hear voices but did not describe them as being troublesome. He however complained of poor concentration and expressed anxiety about returning to work. Dr Goldberg decided that the medication should be increased.

On 5 April 1997 Markos failed to keep his appointment with Dr Goldberg. That afternoon Dr Goldberg saw Yohannes who informed him that Markos was "*in trouble last week*". There is some query as to whether that phrase means that Markos was "*mentally unwell*".

Dr Goldberg saw Markos on 6 April 1997. He looked well but was still experiencing some psychotic symptoms. There appeared to be some problem at his job which led to Markos leaving. There was some concern about the pending immigration decision in respect of Senait.

On 10 April 1997 Dr Goldberg again saw Markos and he is described as being "not so well". He is said to be experiencing sleep disturbance and hallucinations. -

On 14 April 1997, Dr Goldberg wrote to Markos in the following terms:-

(xv) 14 April 1997 (to Markos):-

"Dear Markos

I am sorry to learn that your "voices" have again become troublesome. I know that you have had pains in the head and occasionally in the body and at the moment you feel unable to do regular sport exercise or consider returning to work.

I feel it is important that you continue Stelazine 5 mg twice a day regularly together with Procyclidine if you are feeling muscle stiffness and do as much exercise as possible as this has helped you in the past.

I am sending a copy of this letter to Dr Patel, your GP, and to Simon Lancashire, the CPN with Dr Zolese's team. I hope Simon will get in contact with you shortly and we can then arrange a joint meeting.

Your next appointment here is Thursday 17 April at 3.30 pm. I look forward to seeing you again then".

Dr Goldberg met Mr Simon Lancashire of the Central Wandsworth Mental Health Adult Team on 17 April 1997 to review Markos' case and to make the handover to the Adult Team. He later sent a letter to Mr Lancashire with an update following the actual handover as follows:-

(xxvi) 18 April 1997 (to Simon Lancashire):-

" *Dear Simon*

re: Markos Mezgebe (02.04.77) 45 Wentworth Court, Garratt Lane, SW18

Thank you for coming to the handover meeting. Markos continues to have vague auditory hallucinations at night which he treats with distraction but delays onset of sleep.

I feel that the past strategy of medication step by step, timetabled planning, experimenting with distraction techniques, staying off cannabis and maintaining contact with his brother and sister has been successful.

As a recent relapse has not been well controlled on Stelazine 10 mg per day I feel it may be time to renew his medication with a view to possible change to a newer anti-psychotic.

With best wishes

cc. Dr Patel, GP"

In response to a letter sent by solicitors acting for Senait in her immigration matter, Dr Goldberg wrote on 6 May to Senait's solicitors in support of Senait's application and confirmed the risk which would flow, so far as Markos is concerned from her departure.

Dr Goldberg's last dealing with the Mezgebe family was by letter dated 4 June 1999 when he wrote Yohannes as follows:-

(xxvii) 4 June 1999 (to Yohannes):-

"Dear Yohannes

I was shocked to hear about what has happened to your family.

I remember with warmth my meetings with you, Markos and Senait. I pray for hope for the future and know that Ros Pines also feels deeply.

If you would like to talk to me please do phone or call around here.

With best wishes".

Colin Lambert (CPN)

53. Mr Lambert (CPN) was apparently seconded to Dr Goldberg specifically for this case. This CPN's role during the period when Markos was under the care of Dr Goldberg of the Adolescent Team needs to be considered.

We have already pointed out that Mr Lambert's recollection before the Panel was very vague. What follows therefore has been distilled from the documentary material to hand.

- It has already been noted that Mr Lambert together with Dr Parikh visited Markos' home on 5 January 1995 at which time Dr Parikh took a history from Markos (see para. 48). Thereafter, it seems the CPN temporarily dropped out of the picture immediately after the reference to Dr Goldberg on 17 January 1995.

- The records show that Dr Goldberg did not initially have the assistance of a CPN and that it was on 28 April 1995 that Mr Lambert joined Dr Goldberg. By that time Dr Goldberg had not seen Markos for some weeks (see para 51(x)). The chronology recorded in **APPENDIX V** for 28 April 1995 shows that "*CL CPN Central Wandsworth CMHT is to provide follow up*". A meeting between Dr Goldberg, Markos and the CPN occurred on 17 May 1995 and the records show that Dr Goldberg wrote to Markos on the same date and expressed the view that "*the meeting with Colin Lambert CPN was very helpful*" (see para. 51 (xi)). A review date was apparently fixed for 2 June 1995.
- On 2 June 1995 Markos was seen at Furnage Street by Dr Goldberg and the CPN. Markos's prescription was changed to 15 mg of Stelazine once a day and Procyclidine 5 mg if Markos' "*tongue goes stiff*".
- On 7 June 1995 Mr Lambert, the CPN, visited Markos at home. He is found to be "*less tormented*". Both Markos and Mr Lambert discussed the possibility of a college course.
- On 15 June Mr Lambert watched a video on managing voices in order to give him some insight into their affect on Markos. It is unclear as to whether the watching of the video was in the company of Markos but in any event the CPN did see Markos that day at which time Markos said he was much better and less troubled by voices.
- The CPN again visited Markos at his home on 22 June 1995. Yohannes was present. Markos declared that he was much better. He was informed by Mr Lambert that a careers advisory appointment had been arranged. The visit of 22 June 1995 thus allows Dr Goldberg to express the sentiments recorded in his letter of 26 June 1995 (see para. 51(xiv)).

- Mr Lambert paid another visit to Markos at his home on 13 July 1995. Senait was present. Markos is recorded as being "*much better*".
- There is another home visit on 31 July at which Senait is present. Markos is relaxed and happier and says he is sleeping well. Mr Lambert indicated that he was arranging for Markos a weekend break in Brighton. A prescription is given for the drug Stelazine 5 mg to be taken twice daily. [It will be noted that Dr Goldberg was at this time away - see para. 51(xiv)].
- On 6 October 1995 both the CPN and Dr Goldberg had a session with Markos. At that time Markos said he was not hearing voices. He was at college but he was finding the work difficult.
- The next entry of significance is that Dr Goldberg saw Markos and Yohannes on 19 December 1995. The CPN (Mr Lambert) was not present, he having been on leave. It is not clear from the records when his leave did begin.
- The CPN saw Markos on 28 February 1996 when he had an appointment with Dr Goldberg. Markos is then said to be experiencing hallucinations for some 2 weeks or more and it appears that he had been using cannabis but had stopped it, when he obtained a prescription of Stelazine.
- A CMHT meeting was held on 23 May 1996 at which the CPN discussed Markos' case. Mr Lambert confirmed that he had not had contact with the family since mid-April. It was decided to discharge Markos from Mr Lambert's caseload but only after discussions with Dr Goldberg.

- On 29 May 1996 the CPN visited Markos' home but he was absent, being at work. Senait disclosed that she was concerned about Markos not sleeping and his smoking "weed". She said he appeared to be withdrawn and irritable. There was some doubt about how often Markos was taking his medication.
- The records show that on 30 May 1996 a letter was dictated by Mr Lambert to Dr Goldberg in which he articulated Senait's concerns which had been conveyed to him the day before. It appears that the letter got lost in the system as that letter did not appear to arrive at the Adolescent Team until 18 June 1996.
- The documentary records show that Mr Simon Lancashire became the new key worker for Markos on 15 April 1997. It is not clear from the case notes when the changeover from Mr Lambert occurred. However, in the letter dated 30 May 1996 from Mr Lambert to Dr Goldberg which did not arrive until 18 June 1996, Mr Lambert stated that he was leaving the CMHT and that Markos' case would be closed then. Mr Lancashire was a member of the Adult Team and as will be noted below he became involved in Markos' care when he became 20 and the case was referred back to the Adult Team.

54. From the foregoing narrative as set out in paragraph 51 (*ibid.*), Markos was without a CPN from May 1996 to April 1997 inclusive, though there is evidence of one visit by a Nurse Specialist on 1 August 1996 (see para. 51(xx)-(xxi)). There does not appear to have been a formal handover of Markos' care between Mr Lambert (CPN) and Ms Julie Anderson (Nurse Specialist). Further, Dr Goldberg in his letter to the GP dated 27 January 1997 referred to Markos returning to treatment after a gap of 8 months (see p. 45 - para. (xxii)).

E. THE ADULT SERVICE

55. Following the handover from Dr Goldberg of the Adolescent Team, a formal meeting took place on 17 April 1997 in order to hand over Markos' care to the Adult Psychiatric Team. Dr Zolese who was the Consultant Psychiatrist with formal responsibility for the care of Markos states in her written statement that at that meeting it was agreed that the main areas which would be worked on so far as Markos was concerned were the control of his auditory hallucinations, his ongoing poor concentration and his lack of daytime activity and structure.
56. The chronology set out at **APPENDIX V** states that on 2 May 1997 Dr M Howlett, Senior Registrar to Dr Zolese, reviewed Markos' medication. It was decided to stop the Stelazine and introduce on a trial basis Sulpiride 200 mg twice a day and possibly reduce the Procyclidine medication. Mr Simon Lancashire, CPN, was instructed to keep Markos under review.

Simon Lancashire (CPN)

57. Mr Lancashire's (CPN) involvement with Markos is reflected in the following:-
- On 11 June 1997 he made a home visit at which Senait was present. It was found that Markos had stopped his medication, namely Sulpiride as he believed it made him drowsy. He had resumed taking Stelazine.
 - On 30 June 1997 the CPN wrote to Dr Patel and advised him of Markos' preference of Stelazine 5 mgs twice a day instead of the Sulpiride.

- On 14 August 1997 the CPN made a home visit at which Yohannes, Senait and Markos were present. Markos was said to be feeling well but was somewhat uncomfortable among other people as he felt that they were critical of him.
- On 27 August 1997 the CPN made a home visit. Markos complained of headaches which he agreed to monitor when the sensations occurred.
- On 11 September 1997 the CPN fixed a review date of 11 May 1998.
- On 12 September 1997 the CPN made a home visit. Although said to be relaxed, Markos complained of being bothered by real sounds of voices from a neighbouring flat. He described himself as being comforted by having a "spiritual contest" for his psychotic symptoms.
- On 17 October 1997 there was another home visit by the CPN. Markos was quite well but was still experiencing head pains that affected his concentration. He expressed the desire to live on his own but agreed that this is a longer term goal.
- On 22 October 1997, following a phone call from Yohannes who was then of the view that Markos was unwell, the CPN made another home visit. Markos appeared to be alright and he agreed to see Dr Howlett on 27 October 1997. As it turned out Markos did not attend his appointment.
- On 30 October 1997 both the CPN and Dr Howlett made a home visit. Both agreed that Markos had relapsed, perhaps due to the stress of his college course. It was decided to stop Markos' Stelazine and replace it with Risperidone 1 mg twice a day, and further, that the CPN should see Markos in one week and increase the Risperidone to 2 mg twice a day if Markos did not show an intolerance to the drug.

- On 4 November 1997 the CPN (Mr Lancashire) made a home visit. Markos was not at home but Senait informed Mr Lancashire that Markos reverted to Stelazine after 3 days.
 - On 12 November 1997 the CPN made a home visit. Markos appeared to be well but was complaining of pains and auditory hallucinations. He agreed to resume the Risperidone at the weekend and continue with that medication for a few weeks.
58. The records show that on 21 November 1997 Markos was seen together with Yohannes. He was advised to increase his dose of Risperidone to 2 mgs. On 25 November 1997 Markos was again seen and he described feeling positive benefits from the Risperidone. He agreed to increase the dose to 3 mg twice a day.
59. On 11 December 1997 the CPN wrote to Dr Patel with a medication update including confirmation that Markos was taking Risperidone 3 mgs twice a day.
60. On 29 December 1997 Markos was seen and complained that he had some headaches. Further contact was made between 13 January 1998 and 4 February 1998 at which time Markos' mood was said to be fluctuating. An appointment had been made for Markos with the Volunteer Bureau but Markos disclosed that it would not interest him as it would involve him meeting new people.
61. On 17 February 1998 Markos was visited at his home by the CPN and Ms Premila Sham who was to become the new key worker (CPN) with Markos. Markos was said to be still experiencing anxieties and the possibility of a referral to a psychologist was discussed.

Premila Sham (CPN)

62. Ms Premila Sham, having taken over as Markos' Community Psychiatric Nurse and key worker in February 1998, continued to monitor his mental state and made visits to his home approximately every 2 weeks. Ms Sham's role was to ensure that Markos' mental state remained stable, to monitor any changes in his mood or behaviour and to check compliance with taking his oral medication and to provide support to him and his siblings.
63. Markos' medication was changed from Risperidone to Olanzapine, another anti-psychotic drug, on 26 May 1998 by Dr Zolese.
64. Ms Sham states that throughout the period from when she first became involved in Markos' care to the beginning of August 1998 he claimed to be taking the oral medication prescribed. However, on 4 August 1998 she received a call from Senait who explained that she was worried about Markos who had become angry with her the previous night. Ms Sham made a home visit. Markos appeared to her to be alright but he complained that he was hearing voices and that he believed that his sister was putting pink coloured objects around the flat with the intention of questioning his male identity. An arrangement was made for an appointment with Dr Zolese.
65. On 5 August 1998 Senait admitted to Ms Sham that Markos had not been taking his medication for some 9 days.
66. On 13 August 1998 Markos came to the CMHT base at Furnage Street with his brother Yohannes for an assessment. He appeared well. He said he was not hearing any voices and he assured his CPN that he was taking his medication again.

67. Ms Sham visited Markos at his home on 27 August 1998 when he reported that he remained very well with no psychotic episodes although he indicated that he was still hearing voices occasionally. He confirmed that he was taking his medication and arrangements were made for him to be seen again on 9 September 1998.
68. According to the CPN she saw Markos and Yohannes at the team base on 9 September 1998. Markos looked very well and reported a lesser degree of psychotic symptoms. He said he was still hearing voices occasionally but they were less disturbing and that he could cope with this. He confirmed that he was continuing to take his medication.
69. Ms Sham made a home visit to Markos some 5 days later, that is on 14 September 1998. Yohannes was present and he explained that Markos had had a confrontation with Senait apparently for no reason. Yohannes said that Senait was quite anxious about Markos. According to the CPN Markos was looking quite unsettled and preoccupied and indeed was quite abrupt to her. She checked his medication and discovered he did not seem to have been taking them for 9 days. When he was asked about this Markos maintained that he had been taking his pills. The CPN states that she emphasised to both Markos and his brother the importance of taking the medication.
70. Markos was again seen by the CPN at the CMHT base on 22 September 1998 when he looked well although he was still complaining of hearing voices though to a lesser extent.
71. The next home visit occurred on 5 October 1998. Markos appeared well, good-humoured, energetic and motivated which he attributed to the taking of his medication Olanzapine. Yohannes on the other hand expressed some concern about Markos in that he was waking up at night "*with a terrible start*" and had screamed out. Overall the CPN felt that everything was going well.

72. When Ms Sham arrived at work on 19 October 1998 she was informed of Markos' admission to Springfield Hospital which had occurred the night before.

Dr Maria Gabriella Zolese

73. It has already been noted that Dr Zolese was Markos' Consultant Psychiatrist responsible for his care since April 1997. Further, that she saw him for the first time in person on 26 May 1998 at the CMHT base in Furmage Street following reports from the CPN Ms Premila Sham.
74. Dr Zolese however stated that she was kept regularly informed of Markos' progress and mental state by both CPNs, namely Mr Lancashire and Ms Sham. This information was passed to her mainly from the CMHT meetings which took place at the team base in Furmage Street every Friday morning. All patients are periodically discussed at these meetings by their key workers and the meetings are attended by representatives from the Acute Psychiatric Ward at Springfield Hospital to ensure continuity of care. The records of the CMHT review meetings, according to Dr Zolese, showed that Markos' care was discussed at planned reviews on 2 January 1998, 8 April 1998, 3 July 1998, 25 July 1998 and 30 October 1998.

Markos' admission to Springfield Hospital on 18 October 1998

75. Dr Tamsin Kewley, a registered Medical Practitioner employed by Pathfinder Mental Health Service NHS Trust as a Senior House Officer (SHO) in psychiatry, stated that on Sunday 18 October 1998 whilst on duty as the Duty Officer at Springfield Hospital, she received a call from the "Health Call" GP at Bollingbroke who enquired if she could see Markos at the hospital.

76. Markos arrived on Bluebell Ward at approximately 10.30 pm with his brother and a family friend. Markos appeared very withdrawn and was hardly speaking. Dr Tamsin Kewley was informed that Markos had been acting strangely over the last 3 or 4 days, not sleeping or eating and appeared to be suspicious of his sister, not wanting to stay at the house and instead staying at friends' houses. It was said that Senait had felt frightened of Markos over the last two nights. She had become unsettled with Markos because he was staring at her in an odd way. There was no suggestion of there being any threats or aggression from Markos towards his sister. Rather he had become very guarded, looking around and staring at her as if he was suspicious of her. Yohannes and the family friend felt that the most obvious explanation for Markos' relapse in his mental state was non-compliance with his medication.
77. Dr Tamsin Kewley carried out an assessment of Markos' mental state which was based on observation as Markos was saying very little. The doctor found that Markos appeared suspicious and distracted, continuously looking around, making poor eye contact and smiling inappropriately to himself at times. The main feature of his mental state was that Markos appeared perplexed as if "*there was a lot going on in his mind*". The limited physical examination which the doctor was allowed to carry out revealed normal findings.
78. In the light of Markos' history and the doctor's finding on assessment, it was decided to admit Markos as an informal patient to Bluebell Ward. He was put on level 2 observation which meant that he would be monitored by the ward staff every 15 minutes partly to reassure him as he was quite frightened and vulnerable, having never been in a psychiatric hospital before, and also to prevent any absconding. Dr Kewley emphasised that the decision to put Markos on level 2 observation was not connected with any threat of violence or aggression, there being no history of self-harm or of harm to others.

Markos at Bluebell Ward: 18 October 1998 - 26 October 1998

79. Markos having been admitted to Bluebell Ward on 18 October 1998, he in fact absconded from the hospital on the morning of 19 October 1998. When Ms Sham came on duty and was informed of this fact, she immediately telephoned Yohannes to discuss the situation with him. Yohannes repeated the matters that were conveyed to Dr Kewley and added that he wanted Markos out of the house, because Senait was frightened of him and he of her. Further, Yohannes was irritated because Markos would not get out of bed in the mornings or take his medication. Markos was not there. The CPN told Yohannes that if there were any further developments in respect of Markos she should be informed and would visit the home.
80. A little later Yohannes called Ms Sham and informed her that Markos had returned and had been ringing the front door bell. The CPN therefore went round to the house but Markos was not there and she went looking for him in the Arndale Centre in Wandsworth but was unable to find him.
81. In the event, Yohannes subsequently found Markos and he was taken back to Springfield Hospital with the assistance of two police officers on 19 October 1998.
82. Markos was seen on the ward by Dr Zolese in company with Dr Giovanni Polizzi, a Senior House Officer (SHO) in psychiatry to Dr Zolese and a psychiatric staff nurse Siew Tuan Ng. According to Dr Zolese when she saw Markos he was very vague and perplexed and appeared suspicious of his surroundings. A treatment plan was agreed at the ward round, namely Markos should be started on a depot injection of Flupenthixol 20 mg (the test dose) with a view to ensuring future compliance and that he should be placed on level 2 observation to obviate risk of him absconding. The level 2 observation meant that Markos would be observed by the ward staff every 15 minutes.

83. Markos had a history of cannabis use and it was therefore considered appropriate that he gave a urine sample for drug screening in case that was the reason for his deterioration. The result came back negative.
84. According to Dr Polizzi a note on the ward drug prescription chart indicated that Markos was also prescribed Droperidol 10 mg up to four times a day by the duty psychiatrist and Lorazepam 1-2 mg up to two times a day, PRN (Pro-Re-Nata ie. to be taken as required) by the duty psychiatrist .
85. It was decided that Markos should remain on the ward for a few days for close observation and re-establishment of his medication regime.
86. Dr Zolese's written statement indicates that just after she had finished her ward round on Bluebell Ward, Yohannes stopped her in the corridor and had a talk with her. He said he could "*no longer stand his brother in the house*" and asked if he could be provided a place in a hostel. Yohannes expressed some concern about the Flupenthixol injection being given as he thought Markos was more or less compliant. Dr Zolese agreed to cancel the planned injection and prescribe Olanzapine 10 mg at night. She asked Yohannes to come back to the ward round on 26 October 1998 to discuss the situation with Markos. In the event, Yohannes did not attend the ward round as requested as he had started a new job that day.
87. Both Ms Sham, the CPN, and Dr Polizzi indicate that they saw Markos on Bluebell Ward again on 20 October 1998. According to Ms Sham (CPN), Markos was "*certainly not at his best*". He was quite upset, it being his first ever inpatient admission onto a psychiatric ward. He said he felt scared and reported seeing a woman's face that appeared to him like a dead body. He could not remember anything at all about the days leading up to his admission. At times he became very tearful.

After discussions with the CPN in which she informed Markos that he would have to stay in the hospital to make sure that everything was alright, he appeared to become calmer and was indeed in that state when the CPN left him. According to Dr Polizzi, when he saw Markos on 20 October 1998, he was more prepared to talk than he had been the day before. He expressed doubts about people being against him saying he felt no one was interested in him or wanted to talk to him because he could not speak English properly and felt he was not good at anything. He also admitted with some reluctance that he heard voices in the second and third person which means voices talking to him as well as voices talking to each other about him. Dr Polizzi questioned Markos about his medication. At this Markos asked to leave the hospital being somewhat annoyed that, according to him, he was being asked the same questions again and again. He also expressed suspicion about the tablets Senait had given him at home when he could not sleep one night.

88. On his visit on 20 October 1998 Dr Polizzi carried out a Mental State Examination (MSE). Markos' speech was "*reduced with loosening of association*" which means he was tending to jump from one unrelated thought to another. Markos' mood was blunted, ie. flat. Dr Polizzi however came to the conclusion that overall Markos' condition was somewhat better than it had been the day before.
89. There were discussions between Dr Polizzi and the CPN on the morning of 21 October 1998 which involved the suggestion that Markos could go home on weekend leave that weekend. It was agreed that the CPN would telephone Senait to arrange for her and Yohannes to meet her on Bluebell Ward on the afternoon of 21 October 1998.

90. At the meeting with the CPN, Senait and Yohannes on Bluebell Ward on 21 October 1998, Markos was present. There was a discussion as to whether it would be a good idea for Markos to go home for the weekend for a trial leave period. It was explained by the CPN that if it worked well Markos would be discharged on 26 October. Senait and Yohannes were also told that if they came to the view that Markos was not coping during the weekend, they could bring him back to the ward at any time. All three thought it was a good idea for Markos to have the weekend leave. The psychiatric staff nurse Siew Tuan Ng was appraised of the suggestion of Markos having weekend leave and was content with the decision. She has expressly stated that had she had any concerns about the decision to allow Markos to go on weekend leave, she would have certainly have expressed it.
91. Markos was next seen on Bluebell Ward on 22 October 1998 by Dr Zolese in company with Dr Polizzi and the psychiatric staff nurse Siew Tuan Ng. All were agreed that Markos' mental state had much improved. He no longer looked vague and blank looking; he was smiling and had eye contact. Dr Zolese enquired of Markos whether he understood the importance of taking his medication and he agreed that he did. Markos was asked by Dr Zolese if he wanted to go home on weekend leave to which he replied "*Yes please*". It was therefore agreed by Dr Zolese that Markos could go home if he continued to improve.
92. On the morning of 23 October 1998 there was a CMHT meeting at Furrage Street at which the question of Markos' going home on weekend leave was discussed. Dr Zolese, Dr Polizzi and a Ms Karen Burgess, Occupational Therapist (who had carried out an occupational therapy assessment on Markos whilst on Bluebell Ward) were all agreed that weekend leave was appropriate. There was also discussion about structuring Markos' daytime activities which included a suggestion that he should be put forward for the Springfield Gym. Markos went home on 23 October 1998 and was due back the following Monday, namely 26 October 1998.

93. Markos was not in fact present from weekend leave on the ward round on 26 October 1998. It seems that this was because he had gone to a Community Music Group as part of his occupational therapy.

The decision to discharge

94. Markos' case was discussed by the team on the ward round and it was decided that he should be discharged from the ward to the care of the CPN Ms Sham. He was in fact discharged from Bluebell Ward on Monday 26 October 1998 into the care of Ms Sham. Although Ms Sham did not attend the meeting, she was left a message at the CMHT base to that effect. However, there was no updating of a Care Plan nor any formal assessment of risk indicated, as the clinical notes show. A Discharge Notification dated 26 October 1998 was apparently sent to Dr Patel, Markos' GP.

When Dr Baugh and Dr Minty interviewed Markos and Yohannes at the Shaftesbury Clinic on 18 February 2000, Markos was asked whether anything that had been done could have been done better and he said "no". However, Yohannes said that although Markos' care had been good after discharge, he was surprised and disappointed by the discharge. He maintains that he was not consulted about the discharge and that neither he nor Senait felt Markos should have come home. He was adamant that Markos should have gone to a hostel it being unfair to Senait that Markos should come home "*because she was scared of him*". We should note that the interview by Dr Baugh and Dr Minty was arranged hurriedly because of Yohannes' impending visit to Ethiopia.

Post-discharge: 27 October 1998 onwards

95. Ms Sham, the CPN, indicates that she next saw Markos on a home visit on 27 October 1998. Senait was present throughout the visit which lasted approximately 45 minutes.

During the visit the CPN had occasion to speak to Senait alone. Enquiries were made as to whether Markos had been taking his medication which had been increased to Olanzapine 20 mg on his discharge from Bluebell Ward and Senait indicated that he was. At this home visit, Markos appeared relaxed - he was smiling appropriately and was pleasant to everyone. His sister however did indicate that Markos and his brother were not speaking to each other but enquiries by the CPN as to why this was so were not answered. There was a discussion between Markos and the CPN and Senait as to the possibility of Markos moving to a hostel. Markos said that he thought this was a good idea but Senait was quite against it and wanted him to remain living in the house with her and Yohannes. It was agreed that the matter would be discussed again in about 2 or 3 weeks time. According to the CPN "*Overall, during this visit, Markos did not show any signs of a relapse in his mental state and was pleasant and relaxed. Senait did not express any particular anxiety about him other than to say she was not very happy about the idea of him moving into a hostel*". It was agreed that there would be a further visit on 3 November 1998.

96. Ms Sham visited Markos again on 3 November 1998 as planned. Senait was present. In the absence of Markos, Senait indicated that Markos was fine, that he was sleeping well and his mood was good. He was, she said, taking his medication. The CPN had a conversation with Markos alone and he confirmed the matters which Senait had conveyed to her.
97. According to the CPN, on the visit of 3 November 1998 Markos' mental state was stable and he showed no psychotic features. A further visit was planned for 10 November 1998.

The death of Senait

98. Tragically, Senait was killed at the hands of Markos on 8 November 1998.

F. COMMENTS BY THE PANEL

99. The foregoing narrative makes it clear that Markos suffered from schizophrenia characterised by auditory hallucinations and persecutory delusions. He had been in the care of a number of services over a prolonged period of time, namely Social Services (which included fostering); the Adolescent Service Team and the Adult Service Team. He had been hospitalised at Springfield Psychiatric Hospital from 18 October to 23 October 1998 and had been visited by a Community Psychiatric Nurse some 5 days before the killing.
100. The trigger for the independent enquiry commissioned by Merton Sutton and Wandsworth Health Authority is the fatal incident. Against the backdrop of the matters set out in this report and by reference to the documentary material and the live evidence before us, the Panel is able to sketch the following general comments.

The quality of care

101. We can say at the outset that the quality of care afforded to Markos and his siblings was of a consistently high quality.

The element of risk

102. Prior to the killing Markos had no history of violence to others or of self-harm and had never been detained under any section of the Mental Health Act 1983. As an informal patient, Markos did not meet the criteria of Section 117 of the 1983 Act or the criteria for inclusion in the Supervision Register. Markos had been visited at his home regularly throughout the relevant period and in particular within the period of his discharge from Bluebell Ward.

Both Yohannes and Senait knew that if there were any problems however minor either or both could contact any service that was currently responsible for Markos' care. Indeed that was done a number of times over the period from April 1995 to November 1998 although it seems in September 1998 Senait did not inform Ms Sham, the CPN, that there were difficulties with Markos which in fact led to his hospitalisation. Nevertheless, the Panel will have to consider whether there has been a strict compliance with the statutory obligations, relevant Guidance from the Department of Health including the Care Programme approach, HC (90) 23 - LASSN (90) 11, Discharge Guidance HSG (94) 27 and local operational policies, and if there were a failure whether such failure would have made any difference to the tragic result.

Medication and compliance thereof

103. Markos' prescribed medication was reviewed periodically. Both Yohannes and Senait were appraised of the medication that Markos was given and of the changes when they became necessary. Likewise was Markos' GP. There appears to have been interaction between the GP and the services especially with that of the Adolescent and Adult Service. Whenever Markos' compliance became an issue steps were taken to ensure that he took his medication.

The medication given was appropriate throughout his episode of care and was prescribed in a sensitive and thoughtful manner. For roughly the last six months of Markos' treatment prior to Senait's death, Markos was prescribed Olanzapine, one of the newer and more efficient anti-psychotic drugs. When it became known that Markos might be taking illicit drugs (cannabis) he was strongly advised against it on many occasions.